The Woman's Face In Uqūd Al-Lujain: Study of Misogynist Hadith

Muhammad Fuad Zain

Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Purwokerto, Jl. Jend. A Yani No 40 A Purwokerto 53126

Abstract: The book of Uqūd al-Lujain fi Bayan Huqūq al-Zawjain by Shaykh Nawawi al-Jawi al-Bantani is a thin book in the field of fiqh-tasawuf which is often taught in NU madrassa's which discuss about husband-wife relations, consist of four chapters. In each chapter there are several verses of the Qur'an, hadith, opinions of scholars and Sufi stories that are mostly quoted from the Ihya, 'Umdat, al-Jawāhir, Syarh Nihayah, al-Asmu'iy, and al-Zawajir. The depiction of a woman's face in the Uqud al-Lujain thatwomen's position as the second being after men. This depiction can be seen from the role of women who only carry out domestic activities [cooking, make up, andgiving birth] or sleeping companions. This culture was formed in the beginning of Islam, so that in the present era it is necessary to read and reunderstand the books that are less relevant to the times. Regarding whether the traditions in the Uqud al-Lujain contain misagonists or not need to read with hadith criticismand understanding of the hadith. Here Sheikh Nawawi seems to be more inclined to only use hadith criticism, so that there are many traditions that are less positioned more for more women in domestic life.

Keywords:woman's face; Uqūd al-Lujain; misagonists; husband-wife relations.

I. INTRODUCTION

The book of 'Uqūd al-Lujain fi Bayan Huqūq al-Zawjain by Shaykh Nawawi al-Jawi al-Bantani is a thin book in the field of fiqh-tasawuf which is often taught in madrasa and Islamic boarding schools in Nahdlatul Ulama, this book is also mentioned in the Arabic dictionary al-Munjid(Ma'lūf, 1987). This book discusses a lot of husband and wife relationships which are presented in four chapters. In each chapter there are several verses of the Qur'an, hadith, opinions of scholars and Sufi stories which are mostly quoted from the book of Ihya al-Ghazali, Umdat, al-Jawāhir, Syrian Nihayah, al-Asmu'iy, and al -Zawajir. However, in the reduction of the proposition, especially the hadith and asar of Shahaba, Shaykh Nawawi rarely explains the position or credibility of the hadith.

In the scientific tradition of Nahdlatul Ulama, usually the parents before marrying their children they provide household unification, that is found in the Uqud al-Lujain. It is hoped,by studying this book, their lives will be happy, peace, love and affection mawaddah, mercy and avoid from divorce. Although the divorce in Islam is permissible for the right reasons, as the hadith narrated by Ibn Umr"*Abghad al -halal alā Allah al - talāq* [the most lawful deeds hated by Allah are divorces]"(Daud, 1990).

Martin van Bruinessen mentioned that Qur'anic teachings and traditions are rarely studied directly, but in a form that has been processed in scholastic works on fiqh and faith book. In pesantren, the book of Jalalain is one commentary bookwhich is studied, and there is no collection of traditions at all(Bruinessen, 2012, 152). In historical development, there have been no noticeable changes in the fiqh books taught, but the discipline of Ushul al-Fiqh has been added to the curriculum of many pesantren, thus enabling the development of a more dynamic and flexible of fiqh view.

Among the authors of the book which is often used in the pesantren curriculum is Shaykh Nawawiwhich has a central role in figh books. The evidenced, many books by Shaykh Nawawi that became a source in the teaching of Jurisprudence in pesantren. Shaykh Nawawi was an Indonesian ulama in the Dutch colonial era. Where there are three types of Islamic education models, namely: the Hindu-Islamic transitional education system, the Surau education system, and the Pesantren education system(Ramayulis, 2011).The development of Surau emerged around the middle of the 17th century, due to the large amount of information about Surau concerning tarekat with its various orders, besides the introduction of Sharia law. Sharia law developed in Surau is the basis of Islam; the pillars of Islam, the pillars of faith, and a number of practices. In the next stage the law regarding human relations such as muamalah, inheritance, and marriage(Ramayulis, 2011).

At the end of the 17th century or early 18th century there were three Sufi orders in the archipelago namely Naqsabandiyah, Syattariyah, dan Qadariyahwho had different teaching systems in the field of Sufism.But the three of them still realize that Shari'a law is a compulsory religious material that must be studied first before proceeding to higher and more difficult material. In the field of Shari'a law, all the mosques who have different tarekat studies learn the same fiqh book. The handbook for the study of Shari'a is Minhaj al-Abidīnor more simply called the book of Jurisprudence.

Van Bruinessen explained, in principle, the number of classical texts that received in pesantren was limited. The knowledge is cannot be added, but can only be explained and reformulated. Although there was new work, the content had not changed. The rigidity of this tradition has actually been widely criticized, both are by foreign researchers and reformist and modernist Muslims(Bruinessen, 2012). This term based on the principle ofphilosophy"*al-muhāfażah* '*alā*

al-qadīm al-şāliħ wa al-akhżu bi al-jadīd al-aşlaḥ"or maintain of the old traditions that has benefit and take new for having more benefits. This concepts implies that there is change in the world, to give a signal to keep maintaining the old benefit, but must take a new concept that has more benefits. This concept applies in the field of interpretation, especially in the field of science and technology, or amendments from applicable regulations(Djazuli, 2017).

II.THE BIOGRAPHY OF SHAYKH NAWAWI AL-JAWI AL-BANTANI(1230-1314 H / 1815- 1897 A.D.)

Shaykh Nawawi was born with nameAbū Abdul Muʻti Muḥammad Nawawi bin 'Umar bin 'Arabi in Tanara , Serang, Banten, Indonesia(Amin, 2009).The addition of name"al-Bantani al-Jāwi" is to distinguish between Imam Nawawi al-Damsyiq,both are the great scholars and authors in the Shafi'i school.Shaykh Nawawi is a descendant of Sunan Gunung Jati, one of the fighters and propagators of Islam in the Java that often referred as a part of Walisongo [nine guardians]. He is the first son of the KH. Umar with Nyai Zubaidah. KH. Umar is a religious leader in Tanara Banten. In the lineage of Shaykh Nawawi was the 11th descendant of Syarif Hidayatullah.

Rafiuddin Ramli mentioned the lineage of Shaykh Nawawi from his father as follows:Shaykh Nawawi bin Kiai 'Umar bin Kiai Arabi bin Kiai 'Ali bin Ki Jamad bin Ki Janta bin Kiai Masbuqil bin Masqun, bin Kiai Maswi bin Kiai Tajul 'Arsy bin Syarif Hidayatullahbin Raja Amatuddin Abdullah bin 'Ali Nuruddin bin Jamaluddin Akbar Husain bin Imam Sayyid Ahmad Syah Jalal bin Abdullah Azmah Mālik bin Sayyid Alwi bin Sayyid Muqammad Shahib Mirbat bin Sayyid 'Ali Khali Qasim bin Sayyid 'Alwi bin Imam 'Ubaidillah bin Ahmad Muhajir Ilallahi bin Imam Isa al -Naqib bin Imam Muhammad Naqib bin Imam Muhammad al-Baqir bin Imam 'Ali Zainal 'Abidin bin Hussain bin Fatimah al-Zahra. While from his mother is Shaykh Nawani bin Nyai Zubaidah bint Muhammad Singgaraja(Amin, 2009).

Since five years old, Shaykh Nawawi had received guidance and teaching from his father, KH. Umar. The learning that he got at the first was basic sciences of Islam and Arabic. The teaching from his father lasted about three years, and after that, he and his two young brothers Taimīm and Aḥmad, studied at Hajj Sahal, a teacher in Banten, then to Raden Hajj Yusuf, a famous cleric in the Purwakarta(Amin, 2009).

Chaidar said that Shaykh Nawawi was around 8 years old(Chaidar, 1978). Before studying, Shaykh Nawawi asked for praying and blessing from the mother, Nyai Zubaidah, then she released his by saying: "I pray for youand I bless your, do not go home before this coconutthat I planted was already bearing fruit".Shaykh Nawawi always remembers his mother's message. One day, when he felt he had studied enough at the Hajj Yusuf, he sent letter to his mother to be allowed to go home. Then he and his youngers returned to the pesantren and the coconut tree had also borne fruits.When Shaykh Nawawi was 13 years old, KH. 'Umar, his father, passed away and he succeeded his father as leader of the Tanara boarding school.

Chaidar explained, that new students arrived so the boarding school in Tanara could not accommodate them. Therefore, Shaykh Nawawi was to find another place that that is adequate for learning in pesantren. He chose coastal Tanara, that time was still quiet. He migrate there, it was called coastal Tanara because it was located on the beach(Chaidar, 1978).Although this situation did not long, only 2 years, because Shaykh Nawawi decided to go to Mecca to perform the pilgrimage and study the religious sciences.

In Mecca, Shaykh Nawawi spent his life for studying and teaching. He began his career as a book writer and commentary of a large book, from which he emerged a national cleric who became the pillars of Indonesian independence such as: KH. Hasyim Asy'ari, KH. Mahfudz at-Tarmisi, KH. Ahmad Dahlan, KH. Kholil Bangkalan, KH. Wasith Cilegon. In the right on 25thof Shawwal 1314 H / 1897 AD Shaykh Nawawi passed away in 84 years old. He was buried in Ma'la Mecca, beside Ibn Hajar's graves and Asma bint Abū Bakr(Ramli, 1399).

III. THE WORK OF SHAYKH NAWAWI AL-BANTANI (1230-1314 H / 1815- 1897 AD)

Shaykh Nawawi is a prolific writer of the Shafi'i school(Bruinessen, 2012, 107)as his statement contained in Bahjah al-Wasā'il, he stated that Shafi'i was my schooland Qadiriyah wasmysufism(al-B. Nawawi, 1990).Shaykh Nawawi was Indonesian author who wrote in Arabic, different from previous authors who wrote in local languages.Many of his works ascommentary of books that had been used in pesantren, as explain, complement, or sometimes correct the contents.Sometimes Nawawi's commentary had be come a master books that be replace the previous book.

No less than 22 of his works are still circulating, and 11 titles of his books are recomended of 100 books in pesantren.Hecould stand at the point of transition, between the two periods in the pesantren. He introduced and reinterpreted his intellectual insights, and enriched by writing new works based on books that were not yet known in Indonesia in his day. No exaggeration if he was called by intellectual ancestor(Bruinessen, 2012).

Indeed, Nawawi's works were not only widely studied in Indonesia's pesantren but throughout the Southeast Asian region. Nawawi's bookswerw reviewed in traditional institutions in Malaysia, Philippines and Thailand. Nawawi's books werealso taught in religious schools in Mindanao (Southern Philippines), and Thailand(Steenbrink, 1994).

Nawawi's works in Qur'anic Studies are Tafsīr al -Munīr li Ma'alim al-Tanzil atau lebih dikenali juga dengan nama Tafsīr Marah Labīb li Kasyf Ma'nā Al -Qur'ān Majīd. In hadith are Kitāb Tanqīh al -Qawl, Sharah Kitāb Lubāb al -Hadīth karya Imām al-Suyūtī, Nasā'ih al-'Ibād fī Bayān al-Fāz Munabbihāt 'Ala al-Isti'dād li Yawm al -Ma'ad.In faith are Fath al-Majād Sharh Kitāb al -Dur al -Farād Fi al -Tawhid, Tijān al -Darari Sharh Risalat Fi al -Tauhid karya al-Bajārī. In fiqh are Sullām al-Munājah Sharh Kitāb Safīnah al-Salāh, al-Tawshih Sharh Kitāb Fath al-Qarīb al-Mujīb karya Ibn Qasūn al-Ghāzī, Nihāyah al-Zayn. In moral and sufism are Salālim al-Fudalā merupakan ulasan atas Manzhūmah Hidāyat al-Adhkiya karya Syaikh Zain al-Malibarī, Misbāh al-Zalam, Bidāyah al-Hidāyah. And in history are al-Ibrīz al-Dāni, Bugyah al-'Awam, Fath al-Samad. Dalam bidang Bahasa: Fath Gafīr al-Khatiyah, Lubāb al-Bayān(Arwansyah, 2015).

IV. WOMEN'S FACE IN 'UQŪD AL-LUJAIN

The systematics of 'Uqūd al-Lujain consists of four parts. In the first part, its explain about the obligations of the husband towards his wife. Its contains harmony concept, livelihoods, dowry, visiting schedules for polygamy, educating wives about religion, such as worship, menstruation, and the obligation to obey their husbands as long as they are not immoral.Secondly, in this chapter contains the obedience of the wife to her husband, harmony, surrendering fully to her husband, guarding the house, maintaining respect to avoid the views of other men, avoiding slander, not demanding the husband exceeds his ability, refusing the husband's gift from forbidden acts, do not lie about menstrual conditions experienced. Third, about the virtues of women's prayers at home, using perfume, making up and good looking, the threat of women asking for divorce without the right reason, the signs of women righteous, the testament of women to their children and the reward for women who are pregnant. Fourth, explaining the prohibition of men seeing other women, and vice versa, the law of seeing genitals, touching the opposite sex in medicine, and others(S. Nawawi, 1990).

'Uqūd al-Lujain is a thin book that quotes from various books includingUmdat al-Rābih al-Rafi'i, IhyaUlūm al-Din al-Ghazaly, al-Jawāhir Abū al-Laith al-Samarqandi, Syarah Nihayah ala al-Ghayah, Abdullah al-Wasithi, al-Asmu'y, al-Zawajir 'an Iqtiraf al-Kabair lī Ahmad Ibn Muhammad ibn Aly ibn Hajr and several hadith books such as Sunan al-Tirmidzi, Sunan Ibn Majah, Mu 'jam al-Tabrani, Mustadrak by Imam al-Hakim, Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal and several other hadith books. In addition, Nawawi also inserted sufism stories or the Prophet's companions from Ihya, al-Asmu'y and al-Zawajir.

In fact, some of the traditions that had conveyed by Nawawi are misogynistic traditions, that are supposed to discredit women, although Ahmad Fudhaili states that basically there are no misogynistic traditions, only misogynistic understanding of hadith. Because it is impossible for the Prophet Muhammad to hate women and there is not a single hadith except for false traditions in the form of words, deeds or decrees that show hatred towards women(Fudhaili, 2012).

Precisely in the second chapter, Nawawi cited hadith about threats to wives who reject sexual invitations to husbands as follows: *"izā bātat al-mar'ah muhājirah firāsy zawjihā la 'anathā al-malāikah hattā tusbiha*". In al-Mu'jam al-

Mufahras li alfāż al-itsadits al-Nabawy the hadith is contained in al-Bukhari chapter of marriage no. 87, Muslim chapter Ṭalāq no. 10, and al-Daramiy chapter of marriage no. 38. Then the following of the hadith from itsgenealogy as:

[Having telling us from Muh ammad ibn Basysyār, having telling us Ibn Abī 'Ady, from Syu'bah, from Salmān, from Abī Hārim, from Abī Hurairah RA., The Prophet said: "If a man invites his wife to sleep (sex) then he refuses, then the Angels curse him until morning"]

- (1) The genealogy of traditions in above as:
- (2) Al-Bukhari was born on 194 AH, died on 256 AH;
- (3) Muhammad ibn Basysyār, his full name Muhammad ibn Basysyār ibn 'Utsmān ibn Dāud ibn Kaisān, livedin Basraon 167 H and died on 252 H,he was tsiqah and hafiş, al-Bukhari and Muslims took many history of hadith;
- (4) Muhammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Abī 'Ady, lived in Basra dan died on 194 AH, he was tsiqah.
- (5) Syu'bah ibn al-Ḥujjāj ibn al-Ward, lived in Basra, bornon 83 AH, diedon 160 AH, he was tsiqah, ḥafiż andworshipper.
- (6) Salmān ibn Marwān lived in Kufa, born on 61 AH and died on 148 AH, he was tsiqah andhafis.
- (7) Abī Hā zim, his full name Salmān Maula 'Izzah, livedin Medina dan Kufa, died on 100 AH, he was tsiqah and companionof Abu Hurairah.
- (8) Abu Hurairah, his full name 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Şakhr al-Dausy, he was companions of prophet,diedon 57 AH.

Other traditions in Uqud al-Lujain which describe women, like hadiths below(S. Nawawi, 1990):

['Uthman Ibn al-Haitham told to us, 'Auf told us, from Abī Rajā, from 'Imrān, the Prophet said: I saw heaven, most of its inhabitants were needy people, and I saw hell, most of the inhabitants were woman]

While the scale of scale of transmission or report from:

- (1) Al-Bukhari was born on 194 AH, died on 256 AH;
- (2) 'Uthman ibn al -Haisam, his full name 'Uthman ibn 'Umr al-'Abady, died on 220AH, lived in Basra, he tsabitandsiqqah.
- (3) 'Auf, his full name'Auf ibn Abī Jamīlah al-A'raby, died on 146AH,lived in Basra, he was saduq.
- (4) Abī Rajā ', his full name 'Imrān ibn Malhān al-'Atāridydied on 117AH, lived in Basra, he was siqqah.

(5) 'Imrān, his full name 'Imrān ibn Ḥuṣain al -Azdy, he wascompanions of Prophet, died on 52 AH, live di Basra dan Kufa.

From hadith above was sahih, based on the criteria of sahih hadith as "*mā ittaşal sanad bi naql al-'adl al-dābit 'an mitslih ilā muntahāh min ghair syadhūd wa lā 'illah*". Sahih hadith has creteria as: ittisşāl al-Sanad; 'Adālah al-Ruwāh; Dhabth al-Ruwāh; Adam al-Syadūdz; and'Adam 'illah(Thahan, n.d.).

V. HADITH CRITICISM IN WESTERN DISCOURSE

Western studies in the field of hadith criticism have used the concept of Historical Critical Method which has been used extensively in hadith research.Based on a hadith study of early Islamic historical, Goldziher claimed that the hadith should not be considered as documentary evidence or written evidence because there were no documents written about the life of the Prophet Muhammad when he was still alive[*la taktub annī ghair al -qur'an*].Hadith about the Prophet delivered or narrated through oral which is considered as a very flexible or open medium of counterfeiting or manipulation(Zati Nazifah Bt Abdul Rahim & Nur Syahirah Bt Mohd Wazir & Siti Baizura Bt Solihan & Nur Natasya Nabilla Bt Rosman, 2017).

Furthermore, Goldziher Goldziher had used the concept of anachronism (tracing foreign sentences) and the principle of analogy.Goldziher gave an example of a hadith that refers to a conflict or happen after the Prophet diedwas propaganda solely, and not his own words.For example, hadith which tends to praise al-Shafi'i, perhaps it was created because of a school of conflict, or a hadith that mingled with Shia understanding, certainly designed after the Prophet's died. This propaganda was created by those who were involved in the conflict. The results of the benefits that used by Goldziher was most of the contents of the content or observations of the hadith not only prove that the hadith was false, but who is falsifying it and if the hadith was falsified can also be recognized(Zati Nazifah Bt Abdul Rahim & Nur Syahirah Bt Mohd Wazir & Siti Baizura Bt Solihan & Nur Natasya Nabilla Bt Rosman, 2017). Therefore, Goldziher believed that the hadith was not a history of the true legacy of the Prophet, but instead illustrates the aspirations or desires of the Islamic community at that time.

If referring to the hadith about the neglect of the wife in having sex is nothing else contains an order for married couples in intimate relationships. In this hadith, it can be understood including the prohibition of refusing a husband's invitation to have a relationship either in a state of like or not, if the invitation is lowered then the consequences are the angel's curse until morning. Though the main purpose of marriage is sakina. The emergence of sakina, if in wading marital life there are mawadda and mercy. It can be said, that without mawadda and mercy it is impossible to create sakina as Quranicin al-Rum [30]: 21 *lataskunū ilaiha waja'ala bainakum mawaddah wa raḥmah*. According context of two hadiths above, it's clearly that sanad is sahih, but in its application must in accordance with the context and can be accepted not in coercion. In the study of hadith, there are at least two forms of study that need to be known by the researcher of hadith, namely naqd al-hadīş [hadith criticism] and fiqh al-hadīs [hadith understanding]. The first study emphasizes on the aspects of authority and validity of the hadith in terms of the criticism of the hadith, both are sanad and its material. The second study emphasizes methodological efforts, towards the contextual understanding of hadith(Nirwana, 2014).

So that understanding of the hadith is not wrong, it is necessary to read an accurate and accurate reading of the substance of the hadith

For the understanding of the hadith is correct, researcher of hadith must read accurately the substance of the hadith including:first, understanding the traditions in accordance with the instructions of the Koran; second, gathering traditions that are intertwined in one theme; third, compromising or using a stronger proposition against the traditions that are cursory at odds (al-jam 'aw al-tarjīh bayn mukhtalaf al-hadīts); fourth, understanding the hadith with consideration of the background of the emergence of the hadith, the situation and conditions when the hadith was pronounced and its aims(fahm al-ahādits fī dhaw' asbābihā *wa mulābasatihā wa magāshidihā*);fifth, differentiate between changing means and fixed goals(al-tamyiz bayn al- wasīlah al-mutaghayyirah wa al-hadaf al-tsābit li al-hadīts); sixth, sort out the hadith expressions that are denotative and connotative(al-tafrīq bayn al-haqīqah wa al-majāz fi fahm al $had\bar{t}s$); seventh, to distinguish the traditions that talk about the supernatural and the real world(*al-tafriq bayn al-ghayb wa* al-syahādah); eighth, ensuring the meaning and connotation of words in the hadith(alta'kīd min madlūlāt alfāzh alhadīts)(Nirwana, 2014).

VI. CONCLUSION

The depiction of women's face in Uqūd al -Lujain fī Bayan Huquq al -Zawjainby Shaykh Nawawi al-Jawi al-Bantani, women's position as the second being after men. Thus depiction seen from the role of womenin carrying out domestic activities such as cooking, making up, giving birth, and sleeping companions. This culture was formed in the beginning of Islam, so that in this era, need for reading and reunderstanding of books that are less relevant to this times as the conceptla yunkaru taghayyur al -ahkām bi ta ghayyur alazminah wa alamkinah wa al -ahwal[legal changes occur because of changing times, locality and social situations]. While, wether is the hadith in Uqūd al-Lujaincontaining misagonists or not, it need for reading with nagd alhadīs[hadith criticism] and *fiqh* al-hadīs [hadith understanding] so far. In here Shaykh Nawawi seem more used*naqd* al-hadīs than fiqh al-hadīs, so there are many traditions that were less positioned for women in domestic life.

REFERENCE

- [1]. Amin, S. M. (2009). Sayyid Ulama Hijaz Biografi Syaikh Nawawi al-Bantani. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pesantren.
- [2]. Arwansyah, F. A. S. (2015). Peran Syaikh Nawawi Al-Bantani dalam Penyebaran Islam di Nusantara. *Kontekstualita*, 30(1), 69– 87.
- [3]. Bruinessen, M. van. (2012). *Kitab Kuning, Pesantren dan Tarekat*. Yogyakarta: Gading Publishing.
- [4]. Chaidar. (1978). Sejarah Pujangga Islam Syaikh Nawawi Banteni. Jakarta: CV Sarana Utama.
- [5]. Daud. (1990). Sunan Abū Daud. Beirūt: Dar al- Kutub al-'Ilmiyah.
- [6]. Djazuli, A. (2017). Kaidah-kaidah Fikih; kaidah-kaidah hukum Islam dalam menyelesaikan masalah-masalah yang praktis (7th ed.). Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- [7]. Fudhaili, A. (2012). *Perempuan di Lembaran Suci*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.
- [8]. Ma'lūf, L. (1987). al-Munjid lī al -A'lām. Beirūt: Maktabah al-Syarqiyyah.
- [9]. Nawawi, al-B. (1990). Bahjah al-Wasā'il. Jakarta: al-Hidayah.
- [10]. Nawawi, S. (1990). Uqud al-Lujain fii Bayan Huquq al-Zawjain.

Surabaya: al-Hidayah.

- [11]. Nirwana, D. (2014). Diskursus Studi Hadis Dalam Wacana Islam Kontemporer. Al-Banjari: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman, 13(2), 178–203. https://doi.org/10.18592/al-banjari.v13i2.397
- [12]. Ramayulis. (2011). Sejarah Pendidikan Islam: Napaktilas Perubahan Konsep, Filsafat dan Metodologi Pendidikan Islam dari Era Nabi Saw. sampai Ulama Nusantara. Jakarta: Kalam Mulia.
- [13]. Ramli, R. (1399). Sejarah hidup dan Silsilah Syaikh Kiai Nawawi Tanara Banten. Banten: Yayasan al-Nawawi.
- [14]. Steenbrink, K. (1994). Beberapa Aspek Tentang Islam Di Indonesia Abad ke-19. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang.
- [15]. Thahan, M. (n.d.). Taisir Musthalah al-Hadith. Iskadaria: Markaz al-Hadi li Dirasah.
- [16]. Zati Nazifah Bt Abdul Rahim & Nur Syahirah Bt Mohd Wazir & Siti Baizura Bt Solihan & Nur Natasya Nabilla Bt Rosman. (2017). Kritikan Goldziher terhadap Riwayat Abu Hurairah: Analisis terhadap Hadith Anjing Tanaman. *Journal of Hadith Studies*, 2(2), 20–24.