

Challenges Facing Public-Private Partnerships with Faith Based Organizations aided Secondary Schools in Tanzania

Robert Mukasa and Cosmas Mnyanyi

The Open University of Tanzania, Faculty of Education, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania

Abstract: This study adopted a qualitative research approach and the data collection process included tools like; document analysis and interviews, where nineteen (19) semi-structured interviews were conducted involving six (8) administrators from; (3) Faith Based Organization (FBO) aided schools, (3) private schools and (3) government ministry officials; three (3) officials from public-private intermediary institutions. The purpose of this study was to find out the challenges faced by Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) with FBOs aided schools in Tanzania taking a case of Dar-es-salaam and Pwani regions. The qualitative data were analysed using thematic and content analysis. It was found out that PPPs with FBOs aided secondary schools are passive and ineffective and the only interface between the two sides is at the level of interactions and dialogue. It is recommended that more efforts be spent on the advocacy for PPPs and providing training in the art and craft of designing effective and efficient PPP contracts.

Keywords: Interaction, Faith Based Organisations, Partnerships, Dialogue, Models and Contracts

I. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The National Public Private Partnership policy document (URT, 2009) highlighted the Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) between the Government of Tanzania (GoT) and the Faith based Organisations as a success story worth emulating by other sectors. It was important to conduct an investigation into the nature and type of both the existing and proposed PPPs in the secondary school education sector, with special focus on the Dar-es-salaam region in Tanzania. The term "Public Private Partnerships" is commonly used in the provision of utilities like, secondary education in Tanzania. According to Delmon (2017), PPPs provide a process by which the role of a government as a provider of would-be public services like education is rolled back, while the private sector is deliberately expanded. According to LaRocque (2006), contracting involves a government agency agreeing with a private provider to procure a service, or a bundle of education services, in exchange for regular payments. A slight variation is that of Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, and Guáqueta (2009) definition the process whereby a government procures education or education-related services of a defined quantity and quality at an agreed price from a specific provider.

Omari (2014) discovered that there has been a long running conflict between government, and the Faith Based

Organisation aided schools. According to him, the concept of partnership is problematic, even when it is not supposed to be so. The main problem arises because most partners are greatly unequal. He reiterated that the state should stop dictating terms and the agenda. Omari (2014) gives a chronological account of the frosty and acrimonious relationship between the government and Faith Based Organisations (FBOs) aided schools. In Tanzania, the relationships between the Private - Public Partnership management in the education sector have been chequered, historically rocky, and antagonistic. It is against this background that this qualitative research was conducted to find out the state of affairs given the history of a rocky relationship. It is only appropriate that any inquiry into the nature of PPPs in education sector should review the nature of PPP models both theoretically and realistically (Twaakyondo, Bhalalusesa & Ndalichako, 2002).

This research was based on the results of Mkoga (2013), who conducted research on the "Impact of Public-Private Partnership on Quality Education of Secondary Schools in Tanzania". He found out that, Public private partnership contributed to improving education quality through expansion of student access to schooling. According to him, PPPs helped in delivering education to low-income families, financing school inputs and building school infrastructures and higher academic achievement. However, he did not come up with a clear statement of the types of PPP contracts he studied and he did not mention any school that was run on the basis of PPPs.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The GoT through the National Public private Partnership policy document, (URT, 2009) has indicated the need to mobilise resources from the private to the public sector through the development and promotion of PPPs. Unfortunately, there seems to be disagreement among stakeholders, over the understanding of the types of PPP interactions and their efficacy for the successful delivery of secondary education in Tanzania.

1.3 Purpose of the Study

Based on the research problem, the purpose of this research was to examine the views of both the public and private sector in investigating the nature of the PPP contracts

in the secondary sector in Dar-es-Salaam region of Tanzania. The study specifically, addressed three questions:

1.3.1 Objectives of the study

1. To determine the type of PPP contracts implemented in the Faith Based Organisation aided secondary school education in Dar-es-Salaam region in Tanzania.
2. To explore the views of both the public and private sector stakeholders towards the challenged faced in delivering secondary education through the PPP model.

1.4 Significance of the Study

This study is significant to policymakers and education providers because it has generated new knowledge about the nature of PPPs contracts in FBOs aided secondary schools and the associated PPP models that are implemented in the area of secondary education in Dar-es-Salaam and Pwani regions of Tanzania. Before this study was conducted, there was confusion over the different types of interaction and PPP models between the government and the private sector in FBOs aided secondary school education in Dar-es-Salaam and Pwani regions. The results of this study indicate a clear snapshot position of the PPP interactions, participations, and dialogues (Afonso, & Henne, 2015). Therefore, the results of this study help the stakeholders, to rethink the different ways in which to design efficient and effective PPPs in the education sector.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Operational Definitions

2.1.1 Public Private Partnerships

The term PPP attracts different meanings stretching from participation and dialogue to the actual formation of a partnership between the public and private sectors. The PPP Act of 2009 (URT, 2009) defined a PPP as;

“..a contractual arrangement between a contracting authority and a private part in which the private party; undertakes to perform for contracting authority function on behalf of the contracting authority for a specific period (URT 2017, p5.).

2.2.2 Public-Private Partnership Models

Pidd (2003) defines a model as an external and explicit representation of part of reality as seen by the people who wish to use that model to understand, to change, to manage and to control that part of reality. Models are used as “tools for thinking “, or “convenient worlds”; part of the process of “reflection before action”. PPP models can be seen from different perspectives depending on the arrangement. PPP models can range from performance-based service contracts to full concession; afferimages - lease contracts; management contracts, and service contracts.

2.2.3 Public-Private Interaction

Public private interaction does not involve a formal contract but the exchange of information between the sectors. Public Private Interaction is the basic level where, the public sector reaches out to the private sector, and it ensures that the private sector understands government policies and regulations. Under the public-private interaction, the two sectors share data of their activities with the public sector, as Kamando (2014) indicated that the public sector interacts with the private sector at the community level.

2.2.4 Public-Private Dialogue

This type of partnership, the public and private sectors cooperate and negotiate around issues of mutual interest, focussing on government policies and regulations that impact the private sector. Such a dialogue does not require a formal agreement or a shared investment, but it involves both sectors working together to ensure that policy is formulated effectively to have the best possible outcome. According to Afonso and Henne (2015), a Public-Private dialogue builds up the capacity of private sector organisations to engage with the public sector and advocate on behalf of their members, strengthen the media to cover business topics and initiate relevant research from a range of academic institutions.

III. METHODOLOGY

This study employed a qualitative research approach that involves collecting data based on personal experiences and introspection, through unstructured and semi-structured interviews, and documentary analysis. Denzin and Lincoln (1994) defined qualitative research as a research that focuses on interpretation of phenomena in their natural settings to make sense in terms of the meanings people bring to these settings. The qualitative approach provided the researchers with in-depth knowledge and understandings of multiple perceptions of participants, in the context of the nature of PPP contracts with FBOs aided secondary schools in Dar-es-Salaam and Pwani regions of Tanzania (Braun & Clarke, 2013; Stake 2010). The study was inspired by the phenomenological theory/paradigm to find out the perceptions, views and experiences of the stakeholders involved in the implementation of PPP education policies in Tanzania.

Table 1. Summary of Sample Size and Sampling Techniques

Category	Target population	Sample size	%	Sampling technique
● Private Secondary School Head teachers	10	8	80	Opportunistic
● FBOs aided Secondary school Head teachers	5	3	40	Snowballing
● Tanzania National Business Council (TNBC) officials	5	2	40	Purposive
● Tanzania Private Sector Foundation (TPSF) officials	5	3	60	Purposive
● Institute of Adult Education officials	5	3	60	Purposive
Total	30	19		

3.1 Sampling and Sample Size

Sampling under this qualitative study was done purposefully whereby; participants with the relevant experiences as far as PPP contacts were contacted. Purposive sampling helped the researchers understand the problem from the perspective of the participants (Creswell, 2007). Table 1 shows a summary of sample size where; ten (8) school teachers; 3 Head teachers; Three (3) officials at both the Tanzania National Business Council (TNBC) and two (2) officials at the Tanzania Private Sector Foundation (TPSF) were interviewed.

3.2 Data Collection and Analysis

Data was collected from participants with first hand experiences in the implementation of PPPs in secondary education in Dar-es-Salaam region of Tanzania. While using the documentary analysis and interviewing, the participants were asked to indicate their opinions on numerous issues that were used to trap and collect information relating to the research questions. The data collected through semi-structured interviews and was later subjected to thematic analysis by assigning codes to the insurgent issues, a when the saturation point was reached, a report was written.

IV. RESULTS

The qualitative findings from the interviews were triangulated with the findings from the documentary analysis as reported below;

4.1 Public-Private Partnership in FBOs aided secondary education schools

The findings of this study revealed that currently no long-term formal PPP contracts being implemented in the secondary education sector in Dar-es-Salaam region of Tanzania. Instead the two sectors are relating on the basis of informal interactions and cooperation that fall short of contractually structured PPPs. Respondents were asked the questions in the interview schedule that **“what are the PPP contracts and models being currently implemented in secondary schools in Dar-es-salaam region?”** This question mainly targeted public officials, and the following are some remarks by one of the public sector officers said the following;

“Currently it is official that there are no PPPs in the education sector. Following the reforms, several private-school owners were sensitised and they opened many schools and we are acting independently. The only time we engage in the private sector is through MOUs or ordinary procurement process.

In a quest to determine the nature of PPPs being implemented in the education sector, the researcher visited one of the FBOs aided schools. During one of the interviews, respondents were asked to give their views towards the position given by the government in the National PPP policy (URT, 2009) **that FBO aided schools provide an example of success stories for PPP in the education sector**, a senior administrator of an FBO aided school said;

“What are you talking about? As far as I am concerned I have been here as the head for a long time, but I have never seen such a contract neither have I ever been to a meeting to discuss that PPP. All I know is that the government took over this school in 1968 and the two parties separated that is not what I consider a partnership. I cannot say it was an amicable separation and since then the school is 100 percent government-owned, although the land belongs to the church. The two sides shared the buildings and as you can see that chapel over there belongs to the church and that house over there is the house of the priest. However, the church has no say in how the school is managed.”

The above qualitative data from the interviews indicate that, there is neither long term PPP contracts nor PPP models currently being implemented in the secondary schools education sector Dar-es-salaam region of Tanzania. This finding is supported by the findings of Mukasa, Mnyanyi, and Ngirwa (2021b) that, the relationships between the Institute of Adult education and the Open schools is closest to having PPPs in the education sector in Tanzania. In this *Principal – Agent* arrangement, the IAE is the principal while open schools are the agents that conduct Open Distance Learning (ODL) to the out of school youths but there is no concretised formal concessions PPP model.

Splendid Isolation

One of the salient themes identified from the responses was that there was an independent action in delivering secondary education in Dar-es-salaam region. It was confirmed that currently there is limited interaction collaboration, at best, between the public and private sectors in providing secondary education. A close examination of the qualitative data obtained in the interviews shows that most respondents confirmed that no long-term PPPs contracts were being implemented in the secondary school education sector. Instead, there was a huge gap between the two sectors in terms of cooperation and establishing clear guidelines on the rules of engagement.

The respondents were asked the question that **“then, how are the two sides working together it seems you cannot wish each other away?”** An administrator of a FBO aided school responded that;

“At the moment the church has a representative on the school board as an x-official. His role is limited to that of an observer. He does not come in as part of the PPP arrangement but to represent the church. All I can say is that the two sides are working together, but they are independent of each other.

It was found that there is no working relationship between the government and private schools, which contradicts the position portrayed in the National PPP policy document (URT, 2009), that PPPs have been successfully implemented in the education sector with the FBOs. The administrator’s position was in agreement with the responses from the leaders of the FBO aided schools whose response to the question of **“what is the type of PPP contract does your**

school have? Some responses included that of the headmaster of a FBO aided school who said that;

“Maybe they have a different meaning of the word PPP contract and you should go and ask them. However, as far as I am concerned, there is nothing like that”.

The researcher asked similar questions to the leaders of another FBO aided school and the respondents were 3 school administrators that were interviewed together in a group interview, and some responses were as follows; an administrator of a Faith Based Organisation aided school, had this to say;

“There is no PPP if that is what you are asking because since 1968, the two sides completely separated and the land was shared. Recently, the church built its primary school on their share of the land and we are not concerned. In addition, they are no longer using the church building in the middle of the school campus. They have been able to build a big and better church over there. We are now fully-fledged government schools with no ties at all to the church. The church is free to even start their secondary school and I hear that they are in serious preparations to start a university on the section of the land they shared during the separation.”

In a similar vein to determine how the nature of the relationship between the church and government in managing the school, the researcher asked a probing question of whether the **church has any significant role it plays now in the schools?** Another school administrator said that;

“Apart from sending priests to come to school and conducting prayers, and participating in community programmes organised by the school, the church does not take part in the management of the school, we are completely separate.”

The quantitative data collected from the documentary analysis and interviews confirms that there are no long-term formal PPP contacts in the secondary schools education sector in Dar-es-salaam of Tanzania.

4.2 Challenges faced by PPPs

It was found out that there are serious challenges facing PPPs in FBOs aided secondary schools in Dar-es-salaam and Pwani region of Tanzania. The themes emerged are indicated in Table...

Respondents gave their views on the fractious relationship between the public and private sectors. when asked **to comment about the policy statement in the National PPP policy document that PPPs have been successfully implemented with FBOs**, an administrator of an association of Private school owners had this to say;

“Regrettably, the current PPP policy has not recognised the FBOs’ role in PPP in the education sector. These schools were nationalised I think in 1968 and they are 100 owned by the government, which ended the PPP arrangement...”

It was found that most public sector officials in Tanzania were confronting a serious conflict whereby, on one hand, they must embrace the increase in the size of the public sector at the same time be seen promoting the private sector. The National Public-Private Partnership policy (URT, 2009) gave a clear policy direction of the need to reduce the size of the public sector.

It was also determined that PPPs in secondary schools are facing a challenge of limited possibilities for the two sectors to work together in providing secondary education. It was found that the public sector actors mainly take decisions that are deliberately sizing out the private sector, especially in the education sector. When asked in a probing question over what she thinks **about the need for the government to work with the private sector in providing education services**, a senior public ministry official said that;

“I am worried you are talking about complicated things because there is no way we are working with the private sector currently because we have more government schools that what we even need, therefore there is no need for PPPs...”

Another, public official shared a similar view when he said that;

“For sure if we can develop or own schools that can provide good education the way the government anticipates then, there is no need of entering PPP arrangements with the private schools. If we increase government expenditure on free education PPPs will have no meaning...”

Such an attitude is at the heart of the most government institutions charged with PPP-contracting status, and does not spell well for implementation PPPs in the education sector. The comments and experiences of a leading member of a private sector institution in a different interview confirmed that the institutions that are supposed to work together to produce enduring partnerships are not on the same footing. When asked **what is the kind of relationship with the government?** An administrator of a private school had this to say;

“There are no partnerships because first, it is important to have willing parties to the partnership. More input is needed on behalf of the public sector to accommodate the weak private schools and not wish them a natural death...”

Senior administrators at a leading public school repeated the talk of the “*natural death*” when they were responding to the question about **the possibility of a future working relationship between the two sectors** an headmaster in a public school said;

“These days there is almost no difference between the private schools and the government school. I must admit that some of the more serious private schools are academically performing better than most public schools, but we have tremendously improved. The salary difference is not that big and some of the private schools are even paying less. With such an

improvement, we do not need to work with the private sector. ...”

When asked; **what do you mean by a “natural death”? I had a similar concern from one of the owners of a private school complaining about the same**; one education official said;

“We do not mean that there is a deliberate policy by the government to kill private schools, but if the government schools can put their act together, they can compete favourably with private schools. However, of course, the mediocre private schools with less capital and poor management systems will suffer more and will close...”

It was found out that a huge gulf exists between the two sectors. There is covert hostility especially coming from the public sector schools, local and national administrators.

V. DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

This section discusses some of the major findings from this study. It was determined that there no formal long-term PPP contracts implemented in the secondary school in Dar-es-salaam region of Tanzania. Instead, the primary interface between the public and private sectors in delivering secondary education in Dar-es-Salaam region of Tanzania is the informal PPP interaction and dialogue. Despite the viable supportive institutional framework, there are weak implementation mechanisms for bringing together the stakeholders in the two sectors into a formal level involving contracts Mukasa, Mnyanyi, and Ngirwa (2021a).

The simple interaction and interfaces between the public and private sectors shows that PPPs are mere procurement contracts of delivering or supplying equipment, delivering infrastructure in a principle-agent arrangement but not a PPP contractual arrangement that involves long-term processes and builds on mutual consent. There are normative and subjective interpretations of what different people consider a PPP arrangement. On many occasions, most of the private sector work in delivering education services, along with the public sector, is seen as a PPP arrangement, which is wrong.

VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

It was concluded that the partnership between the two sectors are merely perceived and if any, is only a symbolic gesture, as the two sectors build a network of shared interests and concerns. There are no long-term formal contracts between the public and private sectors in the secondary education sector Therefore there is an urgent need for the Ministry of Education Science and Technology to carefully revisit the publications and writings that present the operation and functioning of PPPs. Otherwise, the position taken to present PPPs in secondary education is based on conjecture and there is lack of concrete evidence to the contrary as Omari (2014) discovered that the current relationship between the FBO and government is acrimonious at best.

It is recommended that the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology should introduce rules backed by

enforcement mechanisms including coercive pressures to formalise the casual interactions and dialogues between the public and private sectors to increase accountability and the mobilisation of resources into the education sector. Formalised contractual relationships between the public and private sectors will enhance the flow of financial, technical and human resources (Itika, 2007).

It is recommended that the PPP intermediaries like TNBC and TPSF should work hand in hand with the Ministry of Education Science and Technology, to find solutions to the causes of conflicts, mutual suspicion, and lack of trust that characterises the acrimonious and frosty relationship between the two sectors (Mukasa, et al., (2021a). A better understanding of the underlying causes of conflict both perceived and real will go a long way in creating the necessary conditions for more formalised contractual obligations.

It is further recommended that the local government authorities in Dar-es-Salaam region, conduct more research with a similar target population should be conducted so as to find out whether the results of this research meet the qualitative criteria of transferability. If another researcher can visit the same study population to confirm the same findings, then it will further confirm that no PPP contracts are being implemented in the running secondary schools in Tanzania, which contradicts the results of the study that was conducted by Mkoga (2013). Similarly, it is recommended that further study a quantitative nature should be conducted so as to enable the generalization of the findings.

In conclusion, this research revealed that there is little attention paid to long-term formal partnerships between the public and private sectors in secondary schools in Dar-es-salaam region of Tanzania. The drive by the GoT towards the provision of universal free secondary education keeps driving a wedge between the two sectors. There are fundamental differences, and parallel views toward the methods of providing secondary education to the extent that there is brewing animosity between the two sectors. Unless special steps are taken to address the departure in points of views, the irreconcilable differences will in future make it very difficult for the two sides to cooperate even at a symbolic level.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We take this opportunity to thank The Faculty of Education at the Open University of Tanzania for their support accorded to us when conducting this research. In a special way we thank the administrators of both public and private schools in Dar-es-Salaam region of Tanzania; special thanks go to the leadership and management of PPP intermediaries like -Tanzania National Business Council and Tanzania, Private Sector Foundation for welcoming us in their offices, and allowing their officers to respond to the questions in the interviews.

REFERENCES

- [1] Afonso, B. & Henne, C. (2015). The potential and challenges of public-private dialogue and partnerships in Tanzania. A real-life analysis of the local investment climate project in Dodoma
- [2] Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*. 3: p. 77–101.
- [3] Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- [4] Delmom J. (2017), *Public-private projects in infrastructure; Second*
- [5] Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications
- [6] Denzin, N. K., and Lincoln, Y. S. (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications
- [7] Itika, J. S. (2007). *Assessment of public-private partnership in health service delivery*. Sokoine University of Agriculture, Tanzania
- [8] Kamando, A. N. (2014). *Government - community partnership in the provision of education in rural Tanzania. A thesis submitted in fulfillment for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy School of Education College of Social Sciences University of Glasgow*. p. 100 –150
- [9] LaRocque, N. (2007). *Options for increasing the scope of public-private partnerships at the universal post-primary education and training level in Uganda*. Prepared for: Ministry of Education and Sports, Government of Uganda
- [10] Mkoga, S. A. (2013). *The impact of public-private partnership on quality education of secondary schools in Tanzania; A Case of Bagamoyo District A Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of The Requirements For The Degree of Master of Education Administration Planning and Policy Studies of The Open University of Tanzania*. pp. 67–68.
- [11] Mukasa, R. Mnyanyi, C. & Ngirwa, C. (2021b). Challenges faced by open schools in implementing the concessions model: a case study of the institute of adult education in Tanzania. *International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research*. ISSN 2348-3164 (online) Vol. 9, Issue 1, pp: (231-243).
- [12] Mukasa, R., Mnyanyi, C. & Ngirwa, C. (2021a). Effectiveness of the business environment in supporting the implementation of public- private partnership policies in Tanzania's education sector. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science (IJRISS)*. Volume V, Issue II. ISSN 2454-6186. P. 393 – 400
- [13] Omari, I. (2014). The predicament of the public-private partnerships in private partnerships. *Journal of Issues and Practice in Education* 6 (1), 1–25
- [14] Patrinos, H. A., Barrera-Osorio, F., & Guáqueta J. (2009). *The role and impact of Public-Private Partnerships in education*. Washington DC: World Bank <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/Education>
- [15] Pidd, M. (2003). *Tools for thinking: Modelling in management science*. 2nd Ed. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- [16] Twaakyondo H., M., Bhalalusesa E., P., & Ndalichako L., (2002). *Factors Shaping Successful Public Private Partnership in the ICT Sector in*
- [17] URT, (2009). *National public-private partnership Policy*. Dar-es - Salaam: Prime Minister's Office, Government Printer