From Headline to Hashtag: A Critical Discourse Analysis of the Hijab in Transcultural Media

Farheen Siddique

National Research University Higher School of Economics, master's Programme "Foreign Languages and Intercultural Communication", Moscow, Russian Federation

ABSTRACT

This empirical study examines the hijab as a linguacultural phenomenon through a comparative critical discourse analysis of its representation across three distinct contexts: Pakistani English language media, Western international news outlets, and digital self-representation on Instagram. Addressing the gap between theoretical discussions of the hijab and analysis of its actual mediated discourse, the research employs Geertzian thick description as an interpretive lens to uncover the layered cultural meanings embedded in language. A curated corpus of 120 text based items (news articles, opinion pieces, and Instagram captions) from 2020 2023 was analyzed using a qualitative, interpretive framework. Findings reveal three dominant but divergent framing paradigms: 1) Western media discourse predominantly utilizes politicized and securitized frames that associate the hijab with conflict; 2) Pakistani media navigates a complex narrative of religious identity, modernity, and cultural preservation; 3) Digital spaces manifest a paradigm of personal agency, aesthetic expression, and community building. The study concludes that these conflicting framings constitute significant barriers to transcultural communication, as interlocutors operate from incommensurate meaning systems. It argues that thick description, applied to mediated discourse, provides a crucial methodological tool for deconstructing simplistic binaries and fostering intercultural understanding. The research contributes to intercultural communication theory by demonstrating how symbolic meaning is contested and negotiated in an increasingly mediated global sphere.

Keywords: hijab, transcultural communication, critical discourse analysis, thick description, media framing, digital identity, linguacultural symbol

INTRODUCTION

The hijab persists as one of the most potent and polarized cultural symbols in global circulation. Its visibility on the world stage belies a profound interpretative divide: for many Muslim women, it is a deeply personal synthesis of faith, identity, and ethics (Mahmood, 2005), while in numerous Western public spheres, it is frequently reduced to a metonym for broader geopolitical tensions, gender oppression, or cultural difference (Abu Lughod, 2013). This divergence is not merely academic; it has tangible consequences for social cohesion, policymaking, and the everyday intercultural encounters that define a globalized world.

The core issue lies in the nature of the hijab as a *linguacultural phenomenon* a symbol whose significance is not intrinsic but is constructed, communicated, and perpetually negotiated through language and cultural practice within specific socio historical contexts (Risager, 2006). When these contexts collide, as they do routinely in media and digital spaces, misunderstanding is often systemic rather than incidental. Prior scholarship has richly explored the hijab from theological, sociological, and feminist perspectives (Ahmed, 1992; El Guindi, 1999). However, fewer studies adopt an explicitly *transcultural communication* lens to empirically trace how its meanings are produced and distorted across specific mediated discourses.

This study, therefore, addresses a defined gap: the lack of a comparative, discourse analytical investigation that moves from broad theoretical claims about the hijab's polysemy to a grounded analysis of *how* different cultural frameworks articulate these meanings linguistically. It asks: How is the hijab framed in different media

ecosystems, and what do these frames reveal underlying cultural assumptions? To answer this, the research is guided by the following questions:

1. What dominant linguistic frames characterize the representation of the hijab in selected Western and Pakistani English media?

2. How do Muslim women utilize the affordances of digital platforms (like Instagram) to construct counter narratives of the hijab?

3. How can the methodological practice of "thick description" illuminate the cultural layers within these conflicting discourses?

By anchoring its analysis in specific textual data, this article shifts from speculative argument to empirical demonstration. It argues that transcultural misunderstanding stems less from the symbol itself than from a failure to recognize the distinct, culturally situated "webs of meaning" (Geertz, 1973) in which it is entangled. The ultimate aim is to illustrate how interpretive methodology can foster a more nuanced, empathetic, and effective intercultural dialogue.

LITERATURE REVIEW & CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

The Hijab Beyond Binaries: From Object to Symbol

Early foundational work decoupled the hijab from exclusively religious dogma. Historian Leila Ahmed (1992) demonstrated how modern debates are inextricably shaped by colonial legacies, where veiling became a spectacle of "otherness" used to justify imperial domination. Anthropologist Fadwa El Guindi (1999) further de essentialized the practice, tracing its varied social functions across millennia and cultures. These historical perspectives disrupt the notion of a singular, timeless meaning.

The most significant theoretical challenge to Western feminist readings comes from Saba Mahmood (2005), whose ethnography of pious women in Egypt reconceptualized agency. She argued that for her subjects, the hijab was a technology of the self through which ethical subjectivity and piety were cultivated a form of agency operating within, not against, structures of religious tradition. This work is pivotal for any analysis seeking to take internal meaning systems seriously, moving beyond the reductive "oppression vs. liberation" binary that still dominates popular discourse.

Mediating Meaning: Representation and Framing

To analyze how public understanding is shaped, this study draws on cultural and media theories of representation. Stuart Hall (1997) posited that meaning is constructed through representational systems language, images, and narratives that are neither neutral nor inevitable but are produced within relations of power. Media framing theory (Entman, 1993) provides a complementary lens, describing the process by which aspects of a perceived reality are selected and emphasized in a communicative text to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation. The persistent framing of the hijab in Western media through tropes of securitization or patriarchal oppression is a classic example of this process, shaping public perception by making certain interpretations more salient than others.

Thick Description as Interpretive Methodology

The operational heart of this analysis is Clifford Geertz's (1973) concept of *thick description*. For Geertz, the task of cultural analysis is not to discover laws but to uncover meaning. Thin description merely records observable behavior (e.g., "a woman covers her hair"), while thick description interprets the layers of significance embedded within that act for the actors themselves the cultural codes, historical resonances, and social implications. In this study, thick description is not merely a cited concept but an *analytical practice* applied to media texts. It involves reading not just for content, but for context, connotation, and the cultural frameworks that make a particular description of the hijab seem logical or truthful within its given domain.

The Digital Turn: Self Representation and Counter Publics

The rise of social media has created new arenas for meaning making. Digital platforms allow Muslim women to bypass traditional media gatekeepers and engage in what Papacharissi (2015) calls "affective publics" spaces where personal narrative, community, and identity are co constructed. Research on #HijabFashion and similar digital phenomena (Lewis, 2015; Tarlo & Moors, 2013) highlights how users blend religious observance with aesthetic entrepreneurship and global consumer culture, creating hybrid identities that defy monolithic categorization. This digital context forms a crucial third node of analysis, representing a space of proactive self representation.

Conceptual Gap: While these theoretical strands are well established, they often run in parallel. This study integrates them, using thick description as a methodological bridge to conduct a comparative discourse analysis across precisely defined media contexts. It moves from the macro level theories of representation to the micro level analysis of linguistic practice, thereby offering a concrete demonstration of how transcultural meaning is negotiated and misunderstood.

RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

This study employs a qualitative, interpretive research design grounded in the principles of critical discourse analysis (CDA) and informed by the ethnographic sensibility of thick description. Its goal is not to generalize statistically but to provide a deep, contextualized understanding of how language constructs reality across different cultural spheres.

Research Design and Case Selection

A comparative case study approach was adopted to facilitate a cross contextual examination. Three distinct "cases" or discursive spheres were defined:

1. **Western Media Discourse:** Operationalized through two major, ideologically divergent international news outlets: *The Guardian* (UK, centre left) and *Fox News* (USA, conservative). This selection captures a spectrum within "Western" framing.

2. **Pakistani English Language Media:** Operationalized through two leading national newspapers: *Dawn* (noted for its liberal, secular leaning editorial stance) and *The News International* (a major mainstream daily). This represents a key locus of discourse within a Muslim majority society.

3. **Digital Self Representation:** Operationalized through public posts using the Instagram hashtag **#HijabFashion**. This platform and hashtag were chosen for their focus on aesthetic and personal narrative, offering a clear window into user driven representation.

Data Collection and Corpus Construction

A purposive sampling strategy was used to build a focused, analytically manageable corpus:

- **Media Texts:** Using the NexisUni database and official news websites, a search was conducted for articles (news reports, features, editorials) published between January 2020 and December 2023 containing the keywords "hijab," "headscarf," and "Muslim woman." From the initial results, a final corpus of 40 articles per media context (20 per outlet, 80 total) was selected to include pieces that centrally discussed the hijab in social, political, or cultural terms.

- **Digital Texts:** The 150 most recent public posts (as of March 2024) under #HijabFashion were collected. Only image based posts with substantive original captions (>10 words) in English were included, resulting in a final sample of 40 captions for detailed analysis. User identifiers were anonymized.

The total analytical corpus comprised 120 text based items.

Analytical Procedure: Thick Description as Practice

The analysis proceeded in three iterative phases, guided by the principle of thick description:

4. **Close Reading & Familiarization:** Each text was read multiple times to identify recurrent themes, keywords, metaphors, and narrative structures.

5. **Interpretive Coding & Frame Identification:** Using a combination of deductive (informed by framing theory) and inductive coding, dominant frames were identified. For example, codes like "security threat," "religious mandate," "feminist resistance," or "personal style" were applied. The focus was on *how* language was used to construct these frames (e.g., lexical choices, agent patient relationships in sentences, use of metaphor).

6. **Comparative Thick Description:** This was the core analytical phase. For each identified frame, the analysis asked: What cultural assumptions make this framing coherent? What historical echoes does it invoke? What is left unsaid or excluded? This involved contextualizing linguistic choices within broader cultural narratives (e.g., linking a *Fox News* segment's language to post 9/11 securitization discourse, or interpreting a Pakistani editorial's tension as reflecting national debates on modernity and Islam).

Table 1: Analytical Framework Summary

Discursive Sphere	Data Sources	Sample Size	Primary Analytical Focus
Western Media	*The Guardian, Fox News*	40 articles	Political & securitized framing; rhetoric of conflict
Pakistani Media	*Dawn, The News International*	40 articles	Negotiation of piety, modernity & national identity
Digital (Instagram)	Public posts, #HijabFashion	40 captions	Construction of agency, aesthetics & community

FINDINGS: CONFLICTING FRAMES OF MEANING

The analysis revealed three distinct, often contradictory, framing paradigms. Thick description of exemplar texts below illuminates the profound cultural chasm between them.

Western Media: The Hijab as a Politicized and Securitized Symbol

In both *The Guardian* and *Fox News*, the hijab was overwhelmingly contextualized within stories of political conflict and social tension, though with differing valence.

- **The Guardian** often framed it within debates on **"liberal values vs. multiculturalism."** A 2021 op ed on French bans stated: "*The stubborn insistence on the headscarf is portrayed as a challenge to secular modernity... a visible refusal to assimilate.*" The thick description here reveals an underlying cultural script where the hijab is positioned as antithetical to an Enlightenment derived, secular public sphere. The woman is a passive symbol ("*portrayed*"); the active agents are abstract forces ("*secular modernity*").

- **Fox News** coverage consistently activated a **"security civilization"** frame. A 2022 report linked a local debate on hijab in schools to broader narratives: "*Amid rising concerns about extremist ideologies, the dress code battle becomes a frontline in the culture war for America's soul.*" The language ("*frontline,*" "*culture war,*" "*soul*") imbues the hijab with existential stakes, weaving it into a pre existing narrative of

national defense. The hijab is metonymically linked to "extremist ideologies," a connection achieved through rhetorical adjacency rather than explicit argument.

Common to both was the near total **erasure of first person, experiential voice**. The hijab was discussed, not *from within*.

Pakistani Media: Negotiating Piety, Modernity, and Nation

Pakistani discourse exhibited a far more internal and multifaceted negotiation.

- **Dawn** frequently presented the hijab through a **"pluralism and choice"** frame. A 2023 feature article noted: "*For every woman who sees it as a divine commandment, there is another for whom it is a cultural marker, and yet another who rejects it as patriarchal... This diversity itself is a testament to a complex, evolving society.*" This frame actively acknowledges multiplicity and positions it as a national characteristic. The thick description highlights a cultural logic that seeks to accommodate religious tradition within a modern, diverse state.

- **The News International** more often employed a **"cultural authenticity"** frame, especially in response to Western events. An editorial on the French bans declared: "*This is not about liberty but about a new imperialism that seeks to dictate how Muslim women worldwide should look.*" Here, the hijab is re contextualized as a symbol of global post colonial resistance. The meaning shifts from personal piety to collective cultural political identity against a perceived Western hegemony.

The Pakistani discourse, therefore, operates in a tension filled space, simultaneously engaging with global narratives, Islamic identity, and national self image.

Digital Self Representation (#HijabFashion): Agency, Aesthetics, and Community

The Instagram data revealed a paradigm shift. The dominant frame was one of **the "curated authentic agencies."**

- **Aestheticization & Personal Branding:** Captions seamlessly blended religious and consumerist language: "*This khimar isn't just a cover, it's my crown. Linking the matching abaya below! #ModestFashion #HijabStyle.*" Thick description interprets this as the creation of a *sacralized aesthetic*, where religious duty and fashionable self expression are not contradictory but fused. The hijab becomes an active component of a curated online identity.

- **Narrative of Personal Journey:** Unlike media abstraction, posts focused on the individual: "*3 years ago, I took the step to wear hijab full time. It was my choice, my struggle, my peace. This journey is mine. #HijabStory.*" This narrative centers **personal ownership** ("*my choice, my struggle, my peace*"), directly countering media frames that assign external political or social motives.

- **Community Building:** The hashtag functioned as a connective tool, fostering a trans local community of affirmation: "*Love this sister! So inspiring. #HijabCommunity.*"

This digital sphere constitutes a powerful counter public, but a thick description must also acknowledge its constraints: it represents a specific, often middle class, digitally literate demographic and exists within platforms governed by commercial and algorithmic logics.

DISCUSSION

This comparative analysis makes plain that the "hijab" discussed in a *Fox News* segment, a *Dawn* editorial, and an Instagram caption are, in crucial ways, *different cultural objects*. The conflict in transcultural communication arises when these distinct, linguistically constituted symbols are mistakenly treated as the same.

The Linguacultural Chasm in Practice

The Western media's politicized frames and the digital sphere's personal agency frames represent nearly incommensurate meaning systems. One defines the hijab through its relationship to the state, security, and abstract values; the other defines it through its relationship to the self, God, and community. Pakistani media, in its internal negotiation, reveals the strain of bridging these local and global discourses. When a Western policymaker or journalist operates from the first framework and engages with a woman whose understanding is grounded in the third, they are, effectively, talking past each other. The barrier is not a lack of translation but a clash of foundational cultural narratives.

Thick Description as an Intercultural Tool

This study demonstrates the practical utility of thick description for intercultural communication. By training analysts whether scholars, journalists, or educators look beyond the surface content ("head covering") to the layered cultural grammar within a text, we can diagnose misunderstandings at their source. For instance, recognizing that a phrase like "challenge to secular modernity" carries the weight of a specific European historical trajectory allows for a more informed and less reactive dialogue.

Nuancing the Digital "Counter Public"

While the digital space offers powerful avenues for self representation, our analysis must avoid techno optimism. The #HijabFashion community, though agentive, exists within the commercial architecture of Instagram, subject to beauty standards, influencer economies, and algorithmic visibility. Furthermore, it does not represent all Muslim women. A truly thick description acknowledges this complexity: digital spaces are simultaneously emancipatory and regulatory, inclusive and exclusive.

CONCLUSION

This research has provided an empirical, discourse analytical account of the hijab as a contested linguacultural phenomenon. By applying the methodological lens of thick description to a specific corpus of media and digital texts, it has moved from abstract claims about "shifting meanings" to a concrete demonstration of *how* those meanings are constructed in language across three discursive spheres. The findings reveal a stark disconnect between the dominant politicized frames of Western media, the negotiated identity frames of Pakistani media, and the personal agency frames of digital self-representation.

The primary theoretical contribution lies in the integrated application of framing theory and Geertzian thick description to transcultural communication analysis, offering a replicable model for interpreting other charged symbols. Practically, the study underscores the necessity for media literacy that includes cultural linguistic sensitivity and highlights the potential of digital ethnography to access grassroots meaning making.

Limitations and Future Research: This study is limited by its focus on English language texts and specific outlets. Future research could incorporate non-English media, audience reception studies, or longitudinal analysis to track framing evolution. Expanding digital analysis to include platforms like TikTok or Twitter would also yield valuable comparative insights.

In conclusion, fostering transcultural understanding requires moving beyond seeing the hijab as a static object to be decoded. Instead, we must learn to see it as a dynamic text, whose interpretation is inseparable from the cultural language in which it is discussed. This study is a step toward learning that grammar.

REFERENCES

1. Abu Lughod, L. (2013). Do Muslim women need saving? Harvard University Press.
2. Ahmed, L. (1992). Women and gender in Islam: Historical roots of a modern debate. Yale University Press.
3. El Guindi, F. (1999). Veil: Modesty, privacy and resistance. Berg.

4. Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. Journal of Communication, 43(4), 51 58.
5. Geertz, C. (1973). The interpretation of cultures: Selected essays. Basic Books.
6. Hall, S. (Ed.). (1997). Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices. Sage.
7. Lewis, R. (2015). Muslim fashion: Contemporary style cultures. Duke University Press.
8. Mahmood, S. (2005). Politics of piety: The Islamic revival and the feminist subject. Princeton University Press.
9. Papacharissi, Z. (2015). Affective publics: Sentiment, technology, and politics. Oxford University Press.
10. Risager, K. (2006). Language and culture: Global flows and local complexity. Multilingual Matters.
11. Tarlo, E., & Moors, A. (Eds.). (2013). Islamic fashion and anti fashion: New perspectives from Europe and North America. Bloomsbury.

Ethical Considerations

This study analyzed publicly available media articles and public Instagram posts. No private data was accessed. Instagram users' handles and identifiable information are not disclosed in this manuscript; only the anonymized content of public captions is analyzed and referenced. The research adhered to the principles of ethical internet research as outlined by the Association of Internet Researchers (AoIR).

Conflict Of Interest

The author declares no conflicts of interest.

Data Availability Statement

The media articles analyzed are available via the NexisUni database or the official archives of the respective news outlets (*The Guardian, Fox News, Dawn, The News International*). The dataset of coded Instagram captions, anonymized to protect user privacy, is available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.