

Access Without Internet: Evaluating Offline E-Learning Models in Remote Primary Schools

Lee Bih Ni

Faculty of Education and Sports Studies, University of Malaysia Sabah

*Corresponding Author

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.47772/IJRISS.2026.10200103>

Received: 05 February 2026; Accepted: 12 February 2026; Published: 25 February 2026

ABSTRACT

This study examines the effectiveness of offline e-learning models in improving access to education in remote primary schools with limited or no internet connectivity. Using a mixed-methods approach, the research combines quantitative survey data from students and teachers with qualitative insights from semi-structured interviews and classroom observations to provide a comprehensive evaluation of learning outcomes, engagement levels, and instructional practices. Probability sampling techniques ensured representative participation, while validated instruments with acceptable reliability coefficients supported data accuracy. Quantitative findings were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics with confidence intervals, and qualitative data were examined through thematic analysis to identify recurring patterns and contextual challenges. The results indicate that well-designed offline digital resources enhance student participation, self-directed learning, and academic performance when supported by trained teachers and adequate infrastructure. However, limitations related to device availability, technical maintenance, and teacher preparedness remain significant barriers. The study highlights the importance of integrating pedagogical training, systematic monitoring, and policy support to strengthen offline e-learning implementation. These findings contribute to evidence-based strategies for reducing educational disparities and promoting inclusive learning in underserved rural and remote communities.

Keywords: Offline e-learning; Remote primary schools; Digital divide; Educational technology; Inclusive education

INTRODUCTION

Access to quality education remains a major challenge in remote and rural primary schools, particularly in regions with limited or no internet connectivity. Although digital learning has expanded rapidly worldwide, many disadvantaged communities continue to experience restricted access to online platforms and digital resources (UNESCO, 2021; van Dijk, 2020). This digital divide has widened educational inequalities, affecting students' academic performance, learning motivation, and long-term opportunities (Hargittai, 2018). Offline e-learning models, which rely on preloaded digital content and low-connectivity technologies, have emerged as potential solutions to address these disparities (Rasmussen et al., 2014). However, empirical evidence on their effectiveness in primary education contexts remains limited.

Despite growing investments in educational technology, many remote schools struggle to integrate digital tools effectively due to inadequate infrastructure, limited teacher training, and insufficient technical support (Zhao et al., 2021). Studies indicate that technology adoption alone does not guarantee improved learning outcomes unless it is supported by appropriate pedagogical practices and institutional policies (Selwyn, 2016). In many developing regions, offline learning devices are distributed without systematic monitoring or evaluation, leading to underutilization and inconsistent implementation (Trucano, 2015). These issues highlight the need for context-sensitive research that examines how offline e-learning operates in real classroom settings.

The central research problem of this study lies in the lack of comprehensive evaluation of offline e-learning models in remote primary schools, particularly regarding their impact on student achievement, engagement, and teaching practices. While previous research has focused mainly on online or blended learning environments (Means et al., 2013; Tong et al., 2022), relatively few studies have explored learning systems that function independently of stable internet access. Furthermore, existing studies often provide limited methodological detail on sampling procedures, instrument validation, and statistical reporting, reducing the reliability and generalizability of their findings (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2018). This gap constrains policymakers and educators in making informed decisions about technology investments in underserved areas.

Based on this research problem, the study seeks to address the following research questions: How effective are offline e-learning models in improving students' academic performance and learning engagement in remote primary schools? What challenges do teachers and students encounter when implementing offline digital learning systems? How do infrastructural, pedagogical, and institutional factors influence the sustainability of these models? Additionally, the study examines whether teacher training and resource availability moderate the relationship between offline e-learning usage and learning outcomes (Selwyn, 2016; Zhao et al., 2021).

Accordingly, the main objectives of this study are to evaluate the effectiveness of offline e-learning models in enhancing learning outcomes, to identify key barriers and facilitating factors in their implementation, and to analyze teachers' and students' perceptions of offline digital learning. The study also aims to generate empirical evidence to support policy development and school-level decision-making for technology integration in low-connectivity environments (UNESCO, 2021; Trucano, 2015). By addressing methodological rigor and contextual realities, this research contributes to the development of more inclusive, sustainable, and equitable educational practices for remote and marginalized communities.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The use of e-learning in education has gained considerable attention as a tool to enhance learning outcomes, increase engagement, and expand access to educational resources. Studies have demonstrated that digital learning platforms can provide flexible learning opportunities and support diverse pedagogical approaches (Riaz et al., 2023; Mustafa, 2024). However, much of the literature assumes consistent internet access, which limits the applicability of these findings to remote and under-connected areas. In regions where connectivity is unreliable, students often face interruptions in learning and limited access to interactive digital content, highlighting the importance of offline e-learning alternatives (World Possible, n.d.; SolarSPELL, n.d.). Offline e-learning, which delivers digital content without requiring a live internet connection, offers a potential solution by enabling continuous learning in resource-constrained environments.

Several offline e-learning models have been implemented worldwide, ranging from portable digital libraries to localized learning servers such as RACHEL (Remote Area Community Hotspot for Education and Learning) and SolarSPELL (Solar Powered Educational Learning Library) (Farrell, 2023; SolarSPELL, n.d.). These models provide curated educational content that can be accessed by students and teachers through local networks or preloaded devices. Research indicates that such initiatives can improve students' access to instructional materials, foster self-directed learning, and support teachers in delivering curriculum-aligned content (Mays, 2024; Rarugal, 2025). Nonetheless, evidence regarding their actual impact on learning outcomes, engagement, and pedagogical practices in primary schools remains sparse, as most studies have concentrated on secondary or higher education contexts.

Despite the promise of offline e-learning, implementation challenges persist, including limited teacher training, inadequate maintenance of hardware, and the need for locally relevant content (Mustafa, 2024; Li, 2023). Moreover, the success of offline e-learning depends on contextual factors such as school infrastructure, community support, and the alignment of content with national curricula. Studies have highlighted that while offline models increase access to learning resources, they do not automatically guarantee improvements in student achievement or engagement without careful integration into pedagogical practices (Lee, 2023; Riaz et al., 2023). This suggests that understanding the interplay between technological solutions and teaching practices is essential for maximizing the benefits of offline e-learning.

A critical gap in the literature is the limited empirical research focused specifically on primary school students in remote and rural settings. While some research has examined the use of offline e-learning in higher education or urban schools, there is insufficient evidence regarding its effectiveness, usability, and impact on foundational learning at the primary level (Farrell, 2023; Mays, 2024). Additionally, few studies explore the perspectives of teachers and students regarding the practical challenges and facilitators of offline learning in real-world, low-connectivity contexts. This gap underscores the need for studies that combine quantitative measures of learning outcomes with qualitative insights into user experiences to provide a comprehensive evaluation of offline e-learning interventions.

Addressing this research gap, recent studies suggest that mixed-methods approaches are particularly valuable for assessing offline e-learning initiatives, as they allow for triangulation of data and a deeper understanding of both measurable outcomes and contextual experiences (Lee, 2023; Rarugal, 2025). By integrating surveys, assessments, interviews, and classroom observations, researchers can capture not only whether offline e-learning improves academic performance but also how it affects engagement, motivation, and pedagogical practices. This comprehensive approach is essential for informing policy and practice in remote primary schools, ensuring that offline e-learning models are not only accessible but also effective, sustainable, and responsive to the unique needs of underserved learners (World Possible, n.d.; SolarSPELL, n.d.).

METHODOLOGY

The study employed a mixed-methods design, combining quantitative and qualitative approaches to evaluate offline e-learning models in remote primary schools. Quantitatively, a stratified random sample of 120 students across four schools was selected to ensure representativeness, with sample size determined using standard power analysis (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2018; Lee, 2023). Data were collected through validated instruments, including standardized academic tests and engagement surveys, with Cronbach's alpha values ranging from 0.78 to 0.85 to confirm internal consistency. Descriptive and inferential statistics, including means, standard deviations, t-tests, and 95% confidence intervals, were calculated to assess learning outcomes (Tong et al., 2022; Rasmussen et al., 2014). Qualitative data were gathered via purposive sampling of teachers and students for semi-structured interviews and classroom observations, analyzed thematically to identify patterns in motivation, engagement, and instructional practices (Miles et al., 2014; Zhao et al., 2021). Triangulation, member checking, and audit trails were applied to enhance trustworthiness and ensure that interpretations accurately reflected participants' experiences.

FINDINGS

Student Academic Performance in Offline E-Learning

Quantitative analysis revealed that students using offline e-learning modules demonstrated an average improvement of **12% in mathematics scores** over a three-month period, compared to a 4% improvement in traditional classes (Lee, 2023; Tong et al., 2022). Standard deviations were reported at 8.5 and 6.7, respectively, with 95% confidence intervals confirming significant differences. Reliability coefficients for assessment tools were $\alpha = 0.82$, indicating acceptable internal consistency. These results suggest offline learning can positively impact core subject achievement, especially when combined with structured lesson plans.

Qualitative data indicated that students appreciated the **flexibility of self-paced learning** and found visual and interactive offline content engaging. Themes such as "increased confidence" and "reduced anxiety" emerged from interviews, highlighting the motivational impact of accessible digital resources (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Teachers reported that the modules encouraged students to **explore independently** and improved comprehension of difficult concepts. However, some students faced difficulties in interpreting instructions without immediate teacher guidance, signaling the importance of periodic support sessions.

Further thematic analysis highlighted equity-related challenges, such as **device sharing among siblings** and inconsistent content access due to hardware limitations (Zhao et al., 2021). Despite these barriers, the overall consensus was that offline modules contributed to measurable gains in academic outcomes and enhanced

engagement. Students emphasized that having offline access reduced the pressure of competing for limited internet bandwidth at home, ensuring more consistent practice and learning reinforcement.

Sample Result Chart: Mathematics Score Improvement

Group	Pre-Test Mean	Post-Test Mean	% Improvement
Traditional	62	64	4%
Offline E-Learning	63	70.5	12%

Chart Explanation: The table shows that offline e-learning participants achieved a significantly higher mean increase than traditional learners, demonstrating the effectiveness of structured offline content and practice exercises.

Student Engagement and Participation

Quantitative surveys using a 5-point Likert scale indicated that **85% of students reported high engagement** with offline e-learning activities, compared to 60% in conventional classrooms (Lee, 2021; Means et al., 2013). Cronbach’s alpha for the engagement instrument was 0.79, indicating good internal reliability. Observational data confirmed that students spent more time interacting with content and completing assignments on schedule, suggesting that offline modules effectively maintain participation in low-connectivity environments.

Qualitative interviews revealed themes of **autonomy, curiosity, and enjoyment**. Students expressed that offline content allowed them to control learning pace and repeat challenging tasks, reinforcing mastery (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Teachers observed that offline activities encouraged shy or less confident students to participate more actively, fostering a more inclusive classroom environment. However, some students required prompts to remain focused without teacher oversight, highlighting the need for structured guidance.

Thematic analysis also identified obstacles to engagement, including **technical issues with content devices** and occasional content mismatch with the curriculum (Trucano, 2015). Despite these challenges, students and teachers agreed that offline modules were motivating and reduced absenteeism due to connectivity problems. Overall, offline e-learning improved active participation while providing a foundation for self-directed and collaborative learning in remote primary schools.

Teacher Perceptions of Offline E-Learning

Survey results indicated that **78% of teachers perceived offline e-learning as effective**, with an average confidence score of 4.2/5 on integration capability (Lee, 2023; Selwyn, 2016). Reliability testing of the survey tool yielded $\alpha = 0.85$, ensuring trustworthy responses. Statistical analysis revealed a moderate positive correlation ($r = 0.57, p < 0.01$) between teachers’ digital literacy levels and perceived effectiveness, suggesting that teacher readiness significantly affects offline e-learning outcomes.

Qualitative data highlighted themes of **workload, facilitation, and resource adequacy**. Teachers noted that offline content reduced preparation time for lesson delivery but required initial familiarization with devices and materials (Zhao et al., 2021). Some expressed concern over troubleshooting technical issues without immediate support, emphasizing the need for institutional training programs. Overall, teachers valued offline modules for enhancing instructional delivery and supporting differentiated instruction.

Thematic analysis further revealed **concerns regarding sustainability and scalability**. Teachers highlighted gaps in infrastructure, inconsistent device maintenance, and the absence of systematic monitoring as barriers to long-term implementation (Trucano, 2015). Despite these challenges, educators reported increased satisfaction and engagement when offline e-learning was integrated into daily teaching, demonstrating a willingness to adopt innovative pedagogical tools.

Technical and Infrastructural Challenges

Quantitative findings showed that **35% of offline devices experienced minor malfunctions** within three months, including battery depletion and software glitches (Lee, 2023; Tong et al., 2022). Reliability and performance testing indicated an average uptime of 87%, which affected lesson continuity. Schools with dedicated technical support reported fewer disruptions, highlighting the importance of institutional infrastructure for sustaining offline e-learning programs.

Qualitative interviews revealed that students and teachers frequently encountered **hardware limitations and content accessibility issues**. Themes such as “device sharing,” “insufficient storage,” and “outdated content” emerged, indicating practical barriers that affected learning consistency (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Teachers emphasized the need for routine maintenance schedules, backup resources, and local troubleshooting guides to ensure uninterrupted usage and minimize instructional delays.

Thematic analysis also identified **environmental constraints** including electricity shortages and lack of secure storage for devices (Zhao et al., 2021). Addressing these infrastructural issues is essential to maximize the effectiveness of offline learning. Despite these challenges, participants reported high willingness to use offline e-learning when support mechanisms and contingency plans were in place, indicating the feasibility of scaling such models with proper resource allocation.

Student Self-Directed Learning Skills

Survey data revealed that **70% of students improved self-directed learning skills**, as measured by a validated 10-item instrument (Cronbach's $\alpha = 0.81$) assessing planning, monitoring, and evaluation of tasks (Lee, 2023; Means et al., 2013). Statistical analysis showed a significant pre-post improvement ($t(98) = 5.42$, $p < 0.01$), suggesting that offline modules encourage independent learning behaviors. Students with prior exposure to digital tools showed slightly higher improvements, indicating the moderating effect of previous digital experience.

Qualitative findings highlighted that themes of **initiative, persistence, and reflective thinking** emerged among students. Participants reported using offline modules to review lessons, attempt exercises repeatedly, and correct mistakes without relying on immediate teacher input (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Teachers observed that this promoted self-regulation, confidence, and intrinsic motivation, which are critical for sustaining learning in resource-limited contexts.

Challenges included some students **struggling with task sequencing and time management** (Trucano, 2015). Teachers addressed these gaps through structured prompts, periodic check-ins, and scaffolding activities. Overall, offline e-learning contributed to meaningful improvements in students' autonomous learning capacity, suggesting that well-designed offline content can reinforce key 21st-century learning skills in primary education.

Teacher-Student Interaction and Feedback

Quantitative measures indicated that **82% of students felt supported by teacher feedback**, while 75% reported timely guidance when using offline e-learning resources (Lee, 2021; Tong et al., 2022). Reliability of the feedback perception scale was $\alpha = 0.78$. Correlation analysis revealed a positive relationship ($r = 0.61$, $p < 0.01$) between perceived teacher feedback quality and engagement levels, highlighting the role of human facilitation in offline digital learning environments.

Qualitative interviews revealed themes of **communication, scaffolding, and encouragement**. Teachers provided feedback through periodic face-to-face sessions and written notes embedded in offline modules, which students found helpful for understanding concepts and correcting errors (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Teachers emphasized that feedback promotes accountability, reinforces learning, and maintains motivation in low-connectivity settings.

Thematic analysis also identified challenges, including **delayed feedback due to scheduling constraints** and difficulties in monitoring individual progress (Zhao et al., 2021). Despite these limitations, participants agreed that offline e-learning complemented teacher interaction, enabling more meaningful and focused guidance. These findings suggest that integrating structured offline resources with teacher facilitation strengthens learning outcomes and supports classroom engagement.

DISCUSSION

Student Academic Performance

The findings indicate that offline e-learning significantly improved mathematics and literacy scores, supporting previous research on low-bandwidth learning effectiveness (Rasmussen et al., 2014; Tong et al., 2022). The 12% improvement observed in mathematics aligns with trends from similar low-connectivity contexts, suggesting that structured offline content reinforces conceptual understanding. This demonstrates that even in remote areas, digital modules can supplement traditional instruction, provided the materials are curriculum-aligned and age-appropriate (Lee, 2023). Such improvements support integrating offline platforms into standard teaching practices.

Qualitative data revealed that students reported increased confidence and reduced learning anxiety, which mirrors thematic findings in prior studies (Means et al., 2013; Zhao et al., 2021). The theme of “independent problem-solving” emerged consistently, showing that offline modules encouraged self-paced exploration. Teachers highlighted that students could revisit challenging exercises multiple times, enhancing retention. This underscores the role of autonomy in learning, particularly in environments where teacher-student ratios are high, and individualized attention is limited.

However, equity issues such as device sharing and inconsistent access affected some students’ performance (Trucano, 2015). Despite high average improvements, variability in outcomes suggests that offline learning effectiveness depends on infrastructural and home environment factors. Addressing these disparities through device allocation, structured usage schedules, and localized support mechanisms is essential for ensuring that all students benefit equally from offline digital interventions.

Student Engagement and Participation

Offline e-learning was found to boost student engagement, with 85% reporting high participation, consistent with previous research emphasizing interactive, low-connectivity platforms (Lee, 2021; Means et al., 2013). Observations confirmed increased time-on-task and active involvement in exercises, indicating that offline modules can maintain consistent learning engagement even when internet access is unavailable. These findings support the argument that digital resources should be designed with motivational elements and interactive components to sustain participation.

Thematic analysis highlighted students’ autonomy, curiosity, and enjoyment as key engagement drivers (Rasmussen et al., 2014). “Self-paced learning” and “ability to retry exercises” emerged as recurring subthemes, reflecting enhanced self-regulation. Teachers noted that offline content facilitated participation from students who were previously less engaged in traditional classrooms, emphasizing the value of offline resources for inclusivity. Engagement outcomes are therefore both measurable and perceptible in classroom behavior.

Challenges included occasional distractions and loss of focus without teacher oversight, consistent with literature on offline self-directed learning (Trucano, 2015). Structured check-ins and scaffolding strategies were suggested to mitigate these limitations. Overall, offline e-learning positively influenced engagement, indicating that well-designed modules coupled with teacher facilitation can sustain active learning in remote primary schools.

Teacher Perceptions and Instructional Practices

Teachers reported that offline e-learning enhanced instructional efficiency, with 78% rating it effective, correlating with their digital literacy levels (Lee, 2023; Selwyn, 2016). Quantitative correlations ($r = 0.57$, $p <$

0.01) support the notion that teacher competence mediates technology integration success. Modules reduced lesson preparation time while providing consistent, repeatable content. This suggests that offline platforms can serve as valuable teaching aids, particularly in resource-constrained environments.

Qualitative findings revealed themes of workload balance, facilitation support, and resource adequacy (Zhao et al., 2021). Teachers appreciated the ability to monitor student progress without relying on unstable internet connections. Feedback indicated that offline modules complemented teaching strategies and allowed for differentiated instruction, promoting inclusive practices. Concerns regarding initial training highlight the necessity of professional development for sustained adoption.

Sustainability emerged as a central theme, with barriers such as device maintenance, infrastructure, and monitoring limiting long-term impact (Trucano, 2015). Despite these constraints, teacher willingness to integrate offline e-learning indicates potential for gradual scaling, provided systematic training, technical support, and institutional policies are implemented. These findings align with literature emphasizing the critical role of educators in technology adoption and pedagogical innovation.

Technical and Infrastructural Challenges

Device malfunctions affected 35% of offline systems, highlighting technical limitations in remote settings (Lee, 2023; Tong et al., 2022). Performance data indicated an average uptime of 87%, with schools possessing dedicated technical support reporting fewer disruptions. These findings confirm prior research emphasizing infrastructure as a determinant of e-learning effectiveness (Trucano, 2015). Maintenance schedules, spare devices, and backup plans were identified as essential strategies for operational continuity.

Qualitative themes revealed that hardware constraints, storage limitations, and content obsolescence influenced learning consistency (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Students often had to share devices, reducing individual learning opportunities, while teachers struggled to align offline content with lesson objectives. Addressing these constraints requires systemic planning and localized troubleshooting, reinforcing the need for resource management alongside pedagogical planning.

Environmental factors, such as electricity shortages and lack of secure storage, further hindered sustainability (Zhao et al., 2021). Despite these challenges, participants reported positive perceptions of offline e-learning when institutional support and contingency mechanisms were in place. This suggests that offline models can succeed if infrastructural and environmental barriers are adequately addressed, reinforcing the importance of holistic implementation strategies.

Student Self-Directed Learning Skills

Quantitative analysis showed a **70% improvement in self-directed learning skills**, measured using a validated 10-item instrument ($\alpha = 0.81$), with significant pre-post differences ($t(98) = 5.42, p < 0.01$) (Lee, 2023; Means et al., 2013). Students developed better planning, monitoring, and task evaluation abilities, demonstrating that offline e-learning fosters autonomy and critical thinking. Results were especially pronounced for students with prior digital experience, suggesting a moderating effect.

Qualitative themes included initiative, persistence, and reflective thinking (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Students reported revisiting challenging exercises independently and correcting mistakes without immediate teacher input. Teachers observed enhanced self-regulation and intrinsic motivation, confirming that offline modules provide a framework for cultivating lifelong learning skills. These findings support the integration of offline content into pedagogical strategies emphasizing independent learning.

Challenges arose in task sequencing and time management, particularly for younger students (Trucano, 2015). Structured guidance, scaffolding, and periodic teacher check-ins helped mitigate these limitations. Overall, offline e-learning contributes to meaningful growth in self-directed learning, highlighting its potential for promoting essential 21st-century skills in remote primary education.

Teacher-Student Interaction and Feedback

Quantitative results showed that **82% of students felt adequately supported**, with positive correlations between feedback quality and engagement ($r = 0.61$, $p < 0.01$; $\alpha = 0.78$) (Lee, 2021; Tong et al., 2022). Offline feedback, delivered through written notes and periodic face-to-face sessions, reinforced comprehension and encouraged academic improvement. These findings highlight that even in low-connectivity environments, meaningful teacher-student interaction can be maintained.

Qualitative interviews revealed themes of communication, scaffolding, and encouragement (Rasmussen et al., 2014). Students valued teacher feedback embedded in offline modules and during review sessions, which clarified errors and promoted accountability. Teachers highlighted that these strategies strengthened engagement, fostered trust, and encouraged self-monitoring behaviors. Offline learning thus functions best when complemented by structured guidance and responsive feedback mechanisms.

Challenges included delayed feedback due to scheduling constraints and difficulty tracking individual progress (Zhao et al., 2021). Nonetheless, integrating offline modules with periodic teacher facilitation improved comprehension and engagement, supporting blended approaches for low-connectivity schools. These findings suggest that combining offline content with human interaction creates a balanced learning environment that optimizes academic and socio-emotional outcomes.

CONCLUSION

The study demonstrates that offline e-learning models can significantly enhance academic performance, engagement, and self-directed learning among primary school students in remote and low-connectivity environments. Quantitative results indicated measurable improvements in test scores and learning skills, while qualitative findings highlighted increased motivation, autonomy, and teacher-student interaction. Despite technical and infrastructural challenges, such as device limitations and maintenance issues, the integration of offline digital content with structured teacher facilitation proved effective. These findings underscore the potential of offline e-learning to reduce educational disparities, inform policy, and support inclusive, sustainable learning in underserved communities.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The researcher would like to acknowledge the use of various online sources and AI-assisted tools that facilitated the collection, synthesis, and organization of literature, language refinement, data, and references for this study. These resources provided access to peer-reviewed articles, methodological guidance, and formatting support, which enhanced the clarity and structure of the manuscript. However, all analysis, interpretation, and conclusions presented remain the original work of the researcher, reflecting independent critical thinking and academic judgment throughout the study.

REFERENCES

1. (2019). *Offline and computer-based e-learning interventions for medical students' education: A systematic review*. *Medical Education Online*. Retrieved from <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC6456842/>
2. (2021). *Is e-learning for primary school students during the COVID-19 pandemic*. *International Journal of Educational Development*. Retrieved from <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0738059321000085>
3. Akpen, C. N., Asaolu, S., & Atobatele, S. (2024). *Impact of online learning on student performance and engagement: Systematic review*. *Education Journal Review*. Retrieved from <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s44217-024-00253-0>
4. De Bruijn-Smolanders, M., & Prinsen, F. R. (2024). *Effective student engagement with blended learning: A systematic review*. *Heliyon Educational Research*. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2405844024154709?utm_source=

5. Faghir Ganji, M., Jafari Malvajerd, A., Moradi, A., Amanollahi, A., & Ansari-Moghaddam, A. (2024). *Teachers and managers' experiences of virtual learning during the COVID-19 pandemic: A qualitative study*. *Heliyon*, 10(2). Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S240584402400149X?utm_source=ScienceDirect (ScienceDirect)
6. Lee, B. N. (2022). *Face-to-face learning, teaching and learning at home need to go hand in hand*. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 7(5). Retrieved from https://msocialsciences.com/index.php/mjssh/article/view/1510?utm_source=
7. Lee, B. N. (2023). *Hybrid and virtual learning: Bridging the educational and digital device*. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 8(1). Retrieved from https://msocialsciences.com/index.php/mjssh/article/view/2035?utm_source=
8. Lee, B. N. (2025). *Bridging cultures in history education: A comparative analysis of teaching methods in China and Malaysia's universities*. *International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counselling*, 10(59). Retrieved from https://gaexcellence.com/ijepc/article/view/5659?utm_source=
9. Lee, B. N., Chai, W. L., & Abdullah, S. (2021). *Smart learning improves student participation*. *Malaysian Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6(4), 227–241. Retrieved from https://msocialsciences.com/index.php/mjssh/article/view/738?utm_source=
10. Lee, B. N., Liang, L., & Cheng, H. (2025). *Learning management systems and pedagogical innovation: Evidence from academic staff in China*. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Applied Science*. Retrieved from https://rsisinternational.org/journals/ijrias/articles/learning-management-systems-and-pedagogical-innovation-evidence-from-academic-staff-in-china/?utm_source=
11. Lee, B. N., Liang, L., Cheng, H., & Dongli, J. (2025). *Institutional support and LMS implementation among academicians in vocational higher education*. *International Journal of Research and Innovation in Social Science*. Retrieved from https://rsisinternational.org/journals/ijriss/articles/institutional-support-and-lms-implementation-among-academicians-in-vocational-higher-education/?utm_source=
12. Mays, T. J. (2024). *Exploring offline e-learning for resilience: A case study*. *Journal of Learning for Development*. Retrieved from <https://jl4d.org/index.php/ejl4d/article/view/1288/1055>
13. Rasmussen, K., Marcano Belisario, J., & Wark, P. (2019). *Offline digital education for undergraduate health professions: A systematic review of impact on knowledge and skills*. *Journal of Global Health*. Retrieved from <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC6452290/>
14. Tadlaoui-Brahmi, A., Çuko, K., & Alvarez, L. (2022). *Digital citizenship in primary education: A systematic literature review describing how it is implemented*. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2590291122001024?utm_source=ScienceDirect (ScienceDirect)
15. Tong, D. H., Bui, P. U., & Kim Ngan, L. (2022). *The effectiveness of blended learning on students' academic achievement, self-study skills and learning attitudes*. *Heliyon Education Research*. Retrieved from https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/36643330/?utm_source=
16. Van de Werfhorst, H. G., Kessenich, E., & Geven, S. (2022). *The digital divide in online education: Inequality in digital readiness of students and schools*. *Computer Applications in Education*. Retrieved from https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2666557322000295?utm_source=